### Planning With Data What to Look at, How to Share It

Chris Collier Alliance for Housing Affordability ccollier@hasco.org

Brooke Eidem, AICP Director City of Snohomish, WA eidem@snohomishwa.gov Linda Redmon Mayor City of Snohomish, WA redmon@snohomishwa.gov

# Putting the Comprehensive in Comprehensive Plan Data

#### **Chris Collier**

Alliance for Housing Affordability Program Manager

### What is Chris, Who is AHA?

- Interlocal Agreement between 15 cities, 1 County, 1 Housing Authority:
  - Arlington, Darrington, Edmonds, Everett, Granite Falls, Lake Stevens, Lynnwood, Marysville, Mill Creek, Monroe, Mountlake Terrace, Mukilteo, Snohomish, Stanwood, Woodway, Snohomish County, HASCO
- Goal: Support members (and communities) in understanding & responding – includes Comprehensive Plans!

### What the GMA Requires:

- Inventory & analysis of existing/planned needs
- All <u>economic</u> segments
- Goals, policies, objectives, for preservation/improvement
- Land capacity
- Housing locations in relations to employment
- Discriminatory/Disparate impacts
- Displacement risk

### What the Legislature (via GMA) Wanted:

Understand your jurisdiction in detail... ...And make your leadership & community understand, too Adjust policy <u>now</u>, for a more equitable community <u>later</u>

Do more than the bare minimum, while leading from behind

Acting against you: An unconvinced public, communications breakdown, an uncertain future, a multitude of disciplines, a council that leads with their *gut*...

#### **Rowing in the Same Direction**



#### And you, just you, by yourself, trying to not screw up:



### What We'll Cover: How To Do The Latter

- Gather & Analyze the Data
  - Do more of what we know (Census)
  - Create new (Home sales & rents, Wage data)
  - Complementary data
- What I hope you'll take away:
  - What more is possible, and what it takes to do it
  - Scan the QR code at the end for a source guide & examples
- Brooke & Mayor Redmon to discuss
  - Bridging the gap between what data says, and what the public wants
  - How Leadership views its role in this, what *they* need to hear and have

### The New Stuff: Analysis of Home Sales

- Contact County Assessor, asked for property sale records
- Break out by city, year sold, home type: Analyze price
- What else does the Assessor give you? For me:
  - Bedrooms, SF (structure & lot), School District, year built, grade...
- Add in loan assumptions = Required Income
- What Does This Look Like?





### Zoom & Enhance!

Snohomish SFR Sales							
		2000		2022			
Med SP	\$	325,752	\$	812,667			
ΡΙΤΙ	\$	2,667	\$	4,746			
Req Inc	\$	96,984	\$	172,584			
# Sold		203		128			
Yrs Old		14	38				
	#	Change	%	Change			
Med SP		486,915	149.47				
PITI		2,079	77.9				
Req Inc		75,600		77.95%			
# Sold		(75)		-36.95%			
Yrs Old				24			

Snohomish Condominium Sales								
		20	00		2022			
Med SP	\$	2	05,057	\$	448,916			
ΡΙΤΙ	\$		1,647	\$	2,673			
Req Inc	\$		59,880	\$	97,203			
# Sold			10		29			
Yrs Old			4	22				
	# C	:hai	nge	% (	Change			
Med SP		2	43,859		<mark>1</mark> 18.92%			
PITI			1,026		62.33%			
Req Inc			37,322		62.33%			
# Sold			19		<mark>1</mark> 90.00%			
Yrs Old					18			

Snohomish Townhome Sales							
		2000	2022				
Med SP	\$	292,342	\$	572,755			
ΡΙΤΙ	\$	2,354	\$	3,326			
Req Inc	\$	85,589	\$	120,932			
# Sold		3		0			
Yrs Old		5		25			
	# (	# Change		Change			
Med SP		280,413		95.92%			
ΡΙΤΙ		972		41.29%			
Req Inc		35,343		41.29%			
# Sold		(2)		-100.00%			
Yrs Old				20			



### **More New Stuff: Labor Statistics**

- Bureau of Labor Statistics, WA Employment Security: Occupational & City Wage Data
  - ESD: Average wage in (city)
    - Jobs ÷ Total Wages Paid = Average for City
  - BLS: What job makes what, for a larger area
    - Comparable wages for your (workforce, police, fire, medical, construction, education) sector
  - By itself not presentable will show up later
- Add in: Workforce transportation mapping
  - LEHD OnThe Map
  - What does THAT Look Like?



LEHD OnTheMap Showcase: Snohomish Workforce Profiles

### **MORE New Stuff: Land Value Per Acre**

- Snohomish & King Counties contracted with Urban3
- Can be done locally with elbow grease
- Core concept:

((Property tax + sales tax) – utilities cost) ÷ parcel area = LVPA Always wanted to add police/fire assumptions for structure & unit

• Data comes from assessor and you – each jurisdiction has sales tax data





### Old & New: Rent, But Not Out of Date

- Survey of Apartments.Com x3 month, sorted by city address
- Not perfect (Small sample size; anonymity of property; date selection; advertised not contract rent)
- BUT STILL:
  - Data allows you to say: "Current apartment shoppers this month found (PRICE) in our city."
  - Access square footage of advertising units
  - = \$ per square foot
- Compare against ownership housing:
  - \$/sf, and monthly mortgage rate

4												
5	Avg Price/Unit	8/15	8/28		9/2		9/15		9/28		10/2	
6	Link											
6 7	All	2,216	\$ 2,219	\$	2,203	\$	2,208	\$	2,180	\$	2,190	n
8 9	Studio	1,659	\$ 1,695	\$	1,667	\$	1,714	\$	1,629	\$	1,630	hann
	1BR	1,983	\$ 1,977	\$	1,974	\$	1,963	\$	1,931	\$	1,949	m
0	2BR	2,407	\$ 2,396	\$	2,361	\$	2,363	\$	2,376	\$	2,376	n m
1	3BR	2,854	\$ 2,860	\$	2,800	\$	2,780	\$	2,809	\$	2,809	nom
12	4BR	V/0!	\$ 3,123	\$	3,061	\$	2,909	\$	3,148	\$	3,058	~~~~
13												
14												
15	Avg SF	8/15	8/28		9/2		9/15		9/28		10/2	
16	Link											
7	All	842	\$ 849	\$	851	\$	858	\$	839	\$	840	han
8	Studio	504	\$ 493	\$	494	\$	517	\$	469	\$	470	m
9	1BR	692	\$ 696	\$	696	\$	691	\$	689	\$	684	hum
0	2BR	967	\$ 970	\$	964	\$	969	\$	962	\$	967	Lan
1	3BR	1,225	\$ 1,224	\$	1,225	\$	1,219	\$	1,222	\$	1,219	m
	4BR	V/0!	\$ 1,599	Ś	1,599	Ś	1,599	Ś	1,599	Ś	1,599	~~~~

### **Combining Data – Workforce Affordability**

Snohomish Workforce Affordability - 1 & x2 Average Wages

Monthly Cost (bar) & Wages (line)

- - Actual Avg. Wages, 1 Worker

Sources:

- WA Employment Security Wages
- Rent Analysis
- Property Sales Analysis & Loan Assumptions

Take it Further:

• BLS OEWS Analysis (Math Professor Can't Afford Rent)

– Actual Avg. Wages, 2 Workers

- Affordable housing figures (WSHFC/HA)
- What else could we do?

### Foundational Data – Census

- Why is this even a slide? Just go to data.census.gov and ask your question
- There are over 1,500 tables across a variety of topics unmanageable
- 1. https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/acs/data/data-tables.html
- 2. Make a list, check it twice, use the Application Programming Interface (API)
- 3. Census API guide:

https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/acs/data/data-via-api.html

- 4. Doing these steps manually is boring. Make a macro! Or two.
- 5. Put the tables in one place

	А	В	С	D	E			н		
1 City	/ Select	Everett city								
2		Table Title	Filt	er 1		Filter 2	Filt	er 3	Gender Filte	r Age Filte
3 Tab	ie ID	Stub 🔽	Category 1 💌	Category 2 🔻	Category 1 💌	Category 2 🔹	Data Detail 🔻	Data Deta 🔻	On/Off	On/Off
40 <mark>B0</mark> 8	203	NUMBER OF WORKERS IN HOUSEHOLD BY VEHICLES AVAILABLE	Misc		Household Si	vehicles				
41 <u>B08</u>	301	MEANS OF TRANSPORTATION TO WORK	Resident Wor	kforce	Transportatio	n				
42 <u>B08</u>	302	TIME OF DEPARTURE TO GO TO WORK	Resident Wor	kforce	Time					
43 <u>B08</u>	303	TRAVEL TIME TO WORK	Resident Wor	kforce	Time					
		SEX OF WORKERS BY MEANS OF TRANSPORTATION TO WORK FOR								
44 <u>B08</u>	406	WORKPLACE GEOGRAPHY	Resident Wor	kforce	Transportatio	n			Sex	
45 <u>B08</u>	412	SEX OF WORKERS BY TRAVEL TIME TO WORK FOR WORKPLACE GEOGRAPHY	Place Workfo	rce	Time				Sex	
46 B08	501	MEANS OF TRANSPORTATION TO WORK BY AGE FOR WORKPLACE GEOGRAPHY	Place Workfo	rce.	Transportatio	n				Age
		MEDIAN AGE BY MEANS OF TRANSPORTATION TO WORK FOR WORKPLACE	ridee workio		Transportatio					~8C
47 <u>B08</u>	503	GEOGRAPHY	Place Workfo	rce	Transportatio	n	Median			Age
48 <u>B08</u>	505A-I Combo	Means Of Transportation to Work for Workplace Geography Combination	Place Workfo	rce	Transportatio	n	Combo			
		MEANS OF TRANSPORTATION TO WORK FOR WORKPLACE GEOGRAPHY								
49 <mark>B08</mark>	505A	(WHITE ALONE)	Place Workfo	Race	Transportatio	Race - White				
		MEANS OF TRANSPORTATION TO WORK FOR WORKPLACE GEOGRAPHY								
50 B08	<u>505B</u>	(BLACK OR AFRICAN AMERICAN ALONE)	Place Workfo	Race	Transportatio	Race - Black				



### **Finding: Snohomish Seniors Struggling**

- B25007; B25045; B25115; B25027; B25072 show...
  - 75-84 y/o are majority renter;
  - 65+ living alone renters a large cohort;
  - <u>50%</u> of 65+ y/o renters cost burdened;
  - <u>There are 71</u> 65+ year old renter HHs with 0 vehicles
- What else? City...
  - ... is majority owner <u>only because of 2 age groups</u>, rest are majority renter
  - ...median move-in year is 2011 (owners) old structures, new people
  - ...has household size/rooms imbalance at 1-2 br homes (own and rent)
  - ...has unusual number of mothers w/ own children who rent why?
  - ...housing production halves in 2010-2019 vs. previous decade

### Affordable Housing: You Aren't On Your Own

- Washington State Housing Finance Commission
  - Active WSHFC Multifamily Rental Properties (link)
- Washington State Dept. of Commerce HTF awards (link)
- Housing Authority(ies) (<u>HUD PHA Contact List</u>)
  - Administer federal housing choice vouchers (HCVs)
  - Subsidized housing units (deep subsidy, grant-funded)
  - Workforce housing (4% LIHTC, self-financed)
- State Programs (MFTE) or Local: You!
- Puget Sound: PSRC Income Restricted Housing Database

### This Presentation Doesn't Help Me

- Sources, Documentation, Guides & Examples Provided On Request!
- Scan RIGHT NOW to Email me (right now!)



Or Later:

ccollier@hasco.org

#### **Phone/Text:**

425-231-2486



## And now, over to Brooke:





## The Small City Perspective



#### **Brooke Eidem, AICP**

Planning & Development Services Director City of Snohomish

## Snohomish

- Central Puget Sound
- Sky Valley between Everett
   and Monroe
- Federally recognized Historic District
- 3.7 square miles
- 10,300 residents
- 52% female/48% male
- Median age 39.8
- Over 18% is age 65+
- Over 20% is <18
- Median HH income \$77,308
- 45% renter/55% owner
- 43% of renters costburdened



### Challenges & Priorities

### **Community Outreach**

Land Capacity Analysis

Data Points

### Putting it Together

### **K 1** Challenges & Priorities

- Small City, small staff, middling resources
- City Council and Planning Commission don't always agree
- Community fear of growth, the unknown
- The "Snohomish character"
- How much capacity do we really have?
- Mixed use zones without development trends

## Strategy

- Ask specific questions
- Engagement, engagement, engagement
- Use civic groups and active residents
- Diverse representation
- Partnerships
- Transparency
- Data-driven decisions (LCA, community preference)

## Growth Targets

0-30% AMI	0-30% AMI		50-80%	80-100%	100-120%	120%+
PSH	non-PSH		AMI	AMI	AMI	AMI
146	0	0	99	183	290	828

Snohomish County "Method C"

### Community Engagement

- Civic Ambassadors
- Kids Design Snohomish
- Missing Middle Monday
- Online survey tools
- Our Future Snohomish Carnival
- Tabling
  - Farmers Market
  - Senior Center
  - Food Bank
  - Annual garbage & recycling event
  - Other community events

## Civic Ambassadors



- Ten community members
- Using individual networks to spread the City's reach and answer questions
- Diverse demographic, geographic, and interest representation
- City provides some suggestions but otherwise left to own devices
- Monthly reporting
- Periodic check-in meetings
- Monthly stipend

## Kids Design Snohomish

- 3-session mini lesson in GMA, City planning, and cartography in elementary schools
- Student maps of their future Snohomish
- Ten students selected to present to the City Council
- <u>Themes</u>: parks and trails, housing, allages activities, walkability, ideas for economic growth, historic preservation
- Positive feedback from parents; flyer sent home with information and QR code
- Middle/high school curriculum in development for fall 2023
- Building blocks at community events
- Coloring book in English, Spanish



### Missing Middle Monday

- Series of videos about housing and growth issues
- Answered questions that were posed by community on social media and elsewhere
- Associated with Middle Housing Analysis project
- Encouraged people to take a housing preferences survey
- Had broad reach and positive feedback
- Used PowerPoint

#### Missing Middle Monday

- Watch a series of videos that provide more information about this project.
- Video 1: What is it and why are we talking about it? (March 20, 2023)
- Video 2: Why does Snohomish have to grow, and by how much? (March 27, 2023)
- Video 3: Congestion and capacity review for development proposals (April 3, 2023)
- Video 4: What about property taxes? (April 10, 2023)
- Video 5: How is affordable and low-income housing financed and built? (April 17, 2023)
- Video 6: What is the Snohomish character? (April 24, 2023)
- Video 7: Visual tour of middle housing types (May 1, 2023)

## **Online Tools**

- 550 responses to Middle Housing survey
- Questionnaire on City website through 2023 (Civic Plus)
- 63% submission rate on values/priorities survey (Balancing Act)
- Housing Simulation survey (Balancing Act)

#### 2024 Comprehensive Plan Periodic Update Questionnaire

#### Welcome to the 2024 Comprehensive Plan Questionnaire!

Housin

Total

Die you know there are people at the City of Shohemish who spend their. cays thinking about where people might want to live, work, shop, do art, play sports, exercise, and grow food in the City? Planners, engineers, and other City staff work each day on projects to help make Shohomish the best place for you and your family. They try to balance things - like traffic, housing, and parks - to make sure the land is being used in the best and most efficient way. Other staff spend their days making sure the important parts of the City, like water, sewer, and mads, are working and



You have a housing plan!									
4 housing units									
Required Planned Growth Targets by 2044 Housing Type Allocation									
<b>ising units (by 2044):</b> 1,546 housing units 🕕	~								
Affordable to households earning 0-30% AMI: 146 housing units	<ul> <li>146 housing units</li> <li>0 housing units</li> <li>146 housing units</li> </ul>	Duplexes and Triplexes: 280 housing units (3)	>						
Affordable to households earning 30-50% AMI: 0 housing units	O housing units O housing units O housing units	Townhomes: 80 housing units (3)	>						
Affordable to households earning 50-80% AMI: 99 housing units	O housing units O housing units O housing units	Multi-Family - small-medium sized complexes: 270 housing units (1)	>						
Affordable to households earning 80-100% AMI: 183 housing units	Discharding units Choosing units Choosing units	Multi-Family - larger sized complexes: 640 housing units	>						
Affordable to households earning 100-120% AMI: 290 housing units	290 housing only Discourse only 290 housing units	Detached Single-Family: 280 housing units ()	>						
Affordable to households earning 120%+ AMI: 828 housing units	288 housing units D housing units 828 housing units	Mixed Use (commercial and residential together) and Live-Wark units: 0 housing units ()	>						
tal 1,546 housing units		Total 1,550 housing units							

### **Our Future Snohomish Carnival & Open House**

- Family activities & games oriented around **Comprehensive Plan** Elements
- Informational handouts for each Element
- Opportunities to comment Staff available to answer
- questions
- Partnerships with local agencies and organizations
  Live music and prizes
  Indoor open house also
- offered
- Over 150 attendees





#### What have we learned so far?

- redo "newer boat ramp - not trailer friendly @ low tae! a plan for our children's future Fences around Parks - Bath Rooms /garbage @ Parks - Allow seniors to age in place - WATER SLIDES ON EVERY CORNER - affordable homes - ELIMATE PLANNING - Just Keep POCKIN' it!!

#### **Highest Priorities**

- Housing affordability
- Housing choice
- Ability for seniors to age in place
- Maintain single-family
- Allow ADUs
- Maintain unique, small-town identity
- Walkability
- Recreation and improved trails
- Managed growth, directed toward periphery (away from Historic District)
- Focus on sidewalks, parks, and environmental

### Land Capacity Analysis

- Commerce Guidance provides good methodology, especially if County does Buildable Lands Analysis
- GIS exercise, checked for accuracy and development likelihood












#### **Lessons Learned**

- 1. Allocate time to Land Capacity Analysis
- 2. Put lots of thought into where growth is likely to occur
- 3. Meet community where they're at: Senior Center, Food Bank, schools, Farmers Markets, civic groups, community events....
- 4. Use online surveys and social media to complement in-person; nothing replaces face-to-face interaction
- 5. Track it all
- 6. Throw a party, not an open house
- 7. Policy/regulatory analysis for HB 1220 can be inhouse
- 8. Rely on your friendly neighborhood housing coalition





# Thank you

Brooke Eidem eidem@snohomishwa.gov



### WHAT ELECTEDS NEED FROM PLANNERS (YOU!)

One perspective among many

Linda Redmon, Mayor City of Snohomish

# **ABOUT ME**

First term elected mayor

Council member for four years, two as Council President

Two years on the Legislative Priorities Committee for the Association of Washington Cities

Represented Snohomish on the Alliance for Housing Affordability as a council member

Live in a duplex that would be considered affordable housing



### THE QUESTION: WHAT DO ELECTED OFFICIALS NEED FROM PLANNERS?



### YOUR ROLE AS PLANNER

#### YOUR STATED TASK

Give Mayors and Council Members a vision of future possibilities

#### PLANNING – WHAT IS IT?

Looking ahead and creating a desired outcome

#### POLICY STARTING POINT

Your sad job is to present this as directly and as bluntly as possible

#### WE ARE AT A CRISIS POINT!

Use words and images that tell the story

(I would not be able to afford to live in Snohomish if I had to move.)

What Electeds Need from Planners (You!)

### **INSIGHT NEEDED**

#### COMPOUNDED FAILURES

Long term inaction for many reasons Policy makers are politicians The system is rigged

#### PUBLIC OPINION/REACTION

The "haves" vs. the "have nots" NIMBY fear Entrenched caste system

#### FINANCIALS

Affordable projects don't "pencil" Need government assistance Financing is hard to come by Legacy of racial covenants

#### LARGER ISSUES

Economic development Demographic shifts Societal trends

#### SURROUNDING VICINITY

Even if we do something to make it better in our city, how will external factors impact our efforts?



### **PFD'S FOR YOUR ELECTEDS & YOU**

#### BUT WE'RE SPECIAL!

Policy should reflect the community's unique needs, based upon personalized data

#### JUST CHANGE FOR CHANGE'S SAKE

Data on results of past policies demonstrate a clear need for changes in policy

#### WHAT'S THE ROI?

Alternatives that are vetted for efficacy allow electeds to defend their choices

#### WISE DECISION!

Electeds want to feel they have been given all the information for them to set the priorities





### **THANK YOU**

Linda Redmon Mayor, City of Snohomish redmon@snohomishwa.gov (360) 282-3154

# Wrap-Up

- The Comp Plan & Elements <u>should</u> be more than a report on a shelf
  - High quality data is publicly available, we can do more
  - Data is half the story; community buy in is the other (and good data helps)
- Elected leadership doesn't know what they don't know
  - Confronting hard truths is, well, hard! Feels like putting your job on the line
  - Convincing data + a persuaded public = (maybe) elected acceptance
- Planners don't (usually) focus on public outreach & coalition building
- What we hope you take away:
  - A new way to look at your jurisdiction
  - "Snohomish did this, we can, too"
  - Examples & ideas to follow, to inspire
- It takes a planner!

### Linda Redmon

Mayor, City of Snohomish redmon@snohomishwa.gov

### **Brooke Eidem, AICP**

Planning Director, City of Snohomish eidem@snohomishwa.gov

# Questions?

### **Chris Collier**

AHA Program Manager ccollier@hasco.org

